

The Four Embracing Practices (saṅgrahavastu):

From their Origin and Development in India to Dogen's Appreciation

〈in English〉

Yusho Wakahara

Professor, Faculty of Letters, Ryukoku University

Abstract

The "four embracing practices" (*catvāri saṅgrahavastūni/cattāri saṅgahavatthūni*) which consists of 'charity/almsgiving' (*dāna*), 'affectionate speech' (*priyavāditā/peyyavajjā*), 'beneficial conduct' (*arthacaryā/atthacariyā*), and 'acting together' (*samānārthatā/samānattatā*) were known from the early period of the Buddhist tradition as practical virtues intended mainly for the laity in ancient India. They were not a conspicuous topic in the early Buddhist canons and exegetical treatises in the so-called Mainstream Buddhism, but were elevated to the altruistic practices of Bodhisattvas in the Mahāyāna school. They are often interpreted as intimately related to the six perfections or *pāramitā* in the context of the Bodhisattva path in the Mahāyāna, thereby leading to a rapid increase in their importance. In contrast to the six perfections, which are taken as benefitting the self, the four embracing practices are identified as the other-benefit practices of instructing sentient beings by means of these perfections.

In the case of the Yogācāra school, which is one of the focuses of this paper, the Bodhisattva is expected to strive for the fulfillment of both self-benefit and other-benefit by means of the six perfections and the four embracing practices after having cultivated benevolence (*maitrī*) and compassion (*karuṇā*) via the Samādhi of the Four Immeasurables (*catur-apramāṇa*). In this sense, the four embracing practices may be interpreted as the embodiment of the mind of benevolence and compassion that has been fostered in meditation.

In Japanese Buddhist tradition, Dogen (1200-1253), the founder of the Soto school of Zen in Japan, took special notice of this theme and devoted an interesting chapter of his main work *The Shobogenzo (The Treasury of the Eye of the True Dharma)* to it. There he is suggesting the possibility of a completely new form of human relationships: relationships based on 'giving' where materiality and spirituality are intermingled or interchangeable.

要旨

本論文は、初期仏教以来主に在家的実践徳目として知られる布施・愛語・利行・同事のいわゆる四攝事（四攝法）をとりあげ、初期仏教から大乘仏教に至るまでの思想史の変遷を概観し、大乘では六波羅蜜と密接に関連する菩薩の利他行として重要な位置を占めていることを主に唯識派の文献によって明らかにすると共に、日本仏教におけるそのユニークな受容の例として道元の主著『正法眼蔵』「菩提薩埵四攝法」章を検討したものである。

四攝事は元来は古代インドにおける世俗的徳目を成句としたものであったと推測され、阿含・ニカーヤにおける用例は決して僅少ではないが、何れも定型的に四攝事が列挙されるのみで具体的な説明を欠く。部派仏教においても四攝事は顕著なトピックではなく、有部論書『集異門足論』に比較的詳しい記述があるのを唯一の例外として、南北両伝のアビダルマ文献において四攝事それ自体は独立した主題として扱われた形跡がない。

一方、大乘仏教に至ると、経典・論書の双方に亘り四攝事が菩薩の実践を代表する徳目として語られる。唯識派論書では菩薩は慈・悲・喜・捨の四無量心（四梵住）によって慈悲を修習した上で六波羅蜜・四攝事による自利利他円満へ向かうべきものとされている。同学派の重要なテキスト『菩薩地』と『大乘莊嚴經論』の記述を要約すれば、四攝事とは布施の実践によって衆生を饒益し、次いで六波羅蜜を教示し、勧奨し、自ら率先してその実践を共にすることである。六波羅蜜を自身の行として見れば自利であり（上求菩提）、その同じ六波羅蜜を他者に伝え共有することによって衆生を成熟させるという四攝事は利他である（下化衆生）。六波羅蜜は大乘に他ならないから、同論は大乘の宣布が菩薩の重要な使命であることを四攝事の称揚により訴えているとも見られる。こうした菩薩の実践の根底には、常に自他平等の無分別智たる般若波羅蜜多が働いていることも注意される。

道元の主著『正法眼蔵』に「菩提薩埵四攝法」と題された一文が収められている。我国の仏家で四攝事に関するまとまった記述を残した例は少なく、従来の研究者は道元の独創性や特異性を強調しがちであるが、彼の論述の基本は大乘の経論にもとづいたオーソドックスなものである。道元の創意工夫は、寧ろ仏典や中国の故事からの豊富で効果的な引例にあると見られ、最も印象的なのは随所に記される彼自身の短い断定的なコメントである。本論では、布施についての記述のみを取りあげて論じた。ここでは、物と心が相互に入り交じり転換されるような、布施にもとづいた新たな人間関係の可能性が示唆される。我々の生と死が全く異なったパースペクティブの中に位置づけられ、日常的営為も新たな光の中で意義づけられるのである。

The Four Embracing Practices (*saṅgrahavastu*): From their Origin and Development in India to Dogen's Appreciation

Yusho Wakahara

Keywords: *saṅgrahavastu/saṅgahavatthu*, Bodhisattva path, *Bodhisattvabhūmi*, *Mahāyānasūtrāṅkāra*, Dogen

Introduction

The "four embracing practices" (*catvāri saṅgrahavastūni / cattāri saṅgahavatthūni* 四攝事, 四攝法) were originally merely one formulation of mundane or ordinary morals in ancient India. They were not a conspicuous topic in the early Buddhist canons and exegetical treatises in the so-called Mainstream Buddhism, but were elevated to one of the important elements of the altruistic practices of Bodhisattvas in the Mahāyāna school. In the context of the Bodhisattva path elaborated by the Yogācāra school, the four embracing practices were interpreted as the other-benefitting practices of instructing and maturing sentient beings by means of the six perfections or *pāramitā* which therein were taken as benefitting the self.

In Japanese Buddhist tradition, Dogen (道元 1200-1253), the founder of the Soto school (曹洞宗) of Zen in Japan, took special notice of this theme and devoted an interesting chapter of his main work *The Shobogenzo* (正法眼藏 *The Treasury of the Eye of the True Dharma*) to it. Interestingly enough, while dealing with the topic, he often refers to everyday manners and morals for comparison, and thus provides a thought-provoking representation of the ancient Buddhist concept.

I. The Four Embracing Practices in the Early Phase of Buddhist Tradition

The so-called 'four embracing practices' (四攝事) which consists of 'charity/almsgiving' (*dāna* 布施), 'affectionate speech' (Skt., *priyavādītā*/Pāli, *peyyavajja* 愛語), 'beneficial conduct' (*arthacaryā/atthacariyā* 利行), and 'acting together' (*samānārthatā/samānattatā* 同事)⁽¹⁾ were known from the early period of the Buddhist tradition as practical vir-

⁽¹⁾ *saṅgrahavastu/saṅgahavatthu* means literally "four bases/grounds for gathering/attracting [people]". The original words for each of the four, except for 'charity' (*dāna*), vary in Sanskrit:

tues intended mainly for the laity. The following passage from *Aṅguttaranikāya* is but one typical example encountered in the *Nikāya* or Pāli Canon⁽²⁾.

Oh, Monks, the embracing practices are four. What are these four? They are charity, affectionate speech, beneficial conduct, and acting together. Oh, Bhikkhus, these are the four embracing practices. [As they are well-known through the following popular verses:]

“Charity and affectionate speech, as well as beneficial conduct associated with the latter,

And acting together [with others] as appropriate to the situation,

Are that which embrace [/bind] society together, just like the linchpin of a moving cart.

If these embrasures did not exist, a mother would not obtain the duty of her children,

That is the respect and devotion [to her]; neither would a father the duty of his children.

Since the wise consider these embrasures,

They win their greatness and become praiseworthy.”⁽³⁾

'affectionate speech' *priyavāditaḥ/priyākhyāna/priyavākya* (*Mahāvastu* (*Mv*)), 'beneficial conduct' *arthacaryaḥ/arthakriyā* (*Lalitavistara*, see F. Edgerton, *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary* (*BHSD*) q.v., and Pali Text Society's *Pali-English Dictionary* (*PTSD*) s.v. *saṅgaha*), 'acting together' *samānārthataḥ/samānasukhaduḥkha(-tā)* (*Mv*, see *BHSD* q.v., *PTSD* loc. cit.; see also *BHSD* s.v. *samānārthataḥ*). Here those encountered in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (菩薩地) and the *Mahāyānasūtrālamkāra* (大乘莊嚴經論) are given. By contrast, in Pāli literature they appear in more or less standardized forms: *dāna*, *peyyavajja*, *atthacariyā*, *samānattatā*, respectively. Noteworthy is the difference between the fourth, 'acting together', in Skt. form *samānārthataḥ* (< *samāna-artha-tā*) and in Pāli form *samānattatā* (< *samāna-attan-tā*). While the former means literally 'having the common object/benefit', which apparently accords with its Chinese renderings 同事, 同利, 等利 etc. and Tibetan translation (*don mthun pa*), the latter means lit. 'having the common self'. Thus *PTSD* (s.v. *saṅgaha*) explains the term as "impartiality (? better as state of equality, i.e. *sensus communis* or feeling of common good)".

⁽²⁾ Other references are as follows: *Aṅguttaranikāya* (*AN*) VIII.23-24 *Haṭṭhaka* (iv.216f) ≡ *Madhyama Āgama* (*MĀ*) (中阿含經) 40 & 41, Taisho 1, 482f., etc. (this sutra will be discussed later in the second chapter of this paper); *AN* IV.153-155 (ii.142) & IX.5 (iv.364) ≡ *Samyukta Āgama* (*SĀ*) (雜阿含經) No. 667-672, T. 2, 185f., etc. (these sutras describe *saṅgaha-vatthu* [攝事] as *saṅgaha-bala* [攝力]); *Dīgha Nikāya* (*DN*) 30 *Lakkhaṇa Suttanta* (iii.153f.) ≡ *MĀ* (中阿) 59, T.1, 493f., etc. (this sutra expounds so-called thirty-two marks of Grand Homme [三十二大人相], and states that the sixth mark, *jālahatthapāda* 'having web-like hands and feet' [手足縵網相], is obtained through the four embracing practices); *DN* 31 *Sigālovāda Suttanta*, (iii.192f.) ≡ *Dīgha Āgama* (長阿含經) No. 12 六方禮經, T. 1, 70f., etc; *Jātaka* No. 424, 462, 468, 532 [in root verses or *gāthā*], 533.

⁽³⁾ *AN* IV. 32 (ii. 32) *Saṅgahavattthusutta* 'The Sutra of the Four Embracing Practices' ≡ *SĀ* (雜阿) No. 669: *cattārimāni bhikkhave saṅgahavattthūni. katamāni cattāri? dānaṃ, peyyavajjaṃ, atthacariyā, samānattatā. imāni kho bhikkhave cattāri saṅgahavattthūnī.*

*"dānaṃ ca peyyavajjaṃ ca atthacariyā ca yā idha,
samānattatā dhammesu tattha tattha yathārahaṃ,
ete kho saṅgahā loke rathassāṇīva yāyato.*

The indigenous commentary ascribed to Buddhaghosa (5 c.) on the relevant *sutta* is interesting and worth citing here:

[*Manorathapūraṇī Aṅguttaranikāyāttakathā* ad AN IV.32]:

'The embracing practices' are the causes of embracing (*saṅgaṇhanakāraṇa*).

"Charity and ...," and so forth [is now commented on]:

Someone could be embraced/attracted solely via charity, and to him, you should only offer 'charity.'

'Affectionate speech (*peyyavajja*)' refers to pleasing words (*piyavacana*). Someone says, "This person does offer charity, yet with a single word he stains everything, and spoils it all. What is the use of this person's charity?" He also says, "This person does not even offer any charity, yet the words he speaks are like rubbing on oil [i.e. gentle and kind]. Whether this person practices charity or not, yet his words by themselves are worth a thousand pieces of gold." Such a one does not hope for charity, but only for affectionate speech. To him, you should simply utter 'affectionate speech.'

'Beneficial conduct (*atthacariyā*)' means beneficial and elevating talk (*atthasaṃvaḍḍhana-kathā*). Someone does not hope for either charity or affectionate speech, but merely hopes for talk that benefits and elevates himself. To such a one you should simply talk of 'beneficial conduct' by saying things such as "You should do that, but you should not do this; you should be close to such-and-such a person, but you should not associate with such-and-such a person."

'Acting together (*samānattatā*)' means sharing both suffering and pleasure (*samānasukha-dukkhabhāva*). Someone does not hope for any charity and so forth, but instead hopes for sharing both suffering and pleasure with others by, for instance, sitting on the same seat, sleeping in the same bed, and taking the same

*ete ca saṅgahā nāssu na mātā puttakāraṇā,
labhetha mānaṃ pūjaṃ vā pitā vā puttakāraṇā.
yasmā ca saṅgahā ete samavekkhanti paṇḍitā,
tasmā mahattam pappontī pāsaṃsā ca bhavanti te" ti.*

如是我聞 爾時世尊告諸比丘，如上說。差別者：若所有法是眾之所取，一切皆是四攝事。或有一取施者，或一取愛語者，或一取行利者，或一取同利者。過去世時，過去世眾已有所取者，亦是四攝事。未來世眾當有所取者，亦是四攝事。或一取施者，或一取愛語者，或一取行利者，或一取同利者。爾時世尊即說偈言：

"布施及愛語，或有行利者，同利諸行生，各隨其所應，以此攝世間，猶車因釘運。

世無四攝事，母恩子養忘，亦無父等尊，謙下之奉事。

以有四攝事，隨順之法故，是故有大士，德被於世間。"

佛說此經已，諸比丘聞佛所說，歡喜奉行。

The stanza cited by the Buddha in this sutra is a *locus classicus* which appears frequently in the relevant sutras of *Nikāya* and *Āgama* given above fn. 2.

meal. If such a person is a layman (*gahaṭṭha*) belonging to the same class (*jāti*) (as your own) and/or if he is a monk (*pabbajita*) observing the same precepts (*sīla*) (as your own) [i.e. belonging to the same Nikāya or School as your own], then toward him you should practice this 'acting together.'

According to this commentary, "beneficial conduct" is restricted solely to verbal expressions. In addition, the interpretation of 'acting together' as 'sharing both suffering and pleasure' (*samānasukhadukkhabhāva*) corresponds to the same wording '*samānasukhaduḥkha(-tā)*' which is given as the source of the term "acting together" in the *Mahāvastu* (i.3.12, see above fn. 1)⁽⁴⁾. The last sentence of the commentary reads disappointing although it poses some interpretational difficulty.

While the four embracing practices are not a noteworthy topic in so-called Mainstream Buddhism in India⁽⁵⁾, they are often interpreted as intimately related to the six perfections or *pāramitā* in the context of the Bodhisattva path in the Mahāyāna, thereby leading to a rapid increase in their importance⁽⁶⁾. In contrast to the six perfec-

⁽⁴⁾ The work refers itself as belonging to the Lokottara-vādin of the Mahāsaṅghika school.

⁽⁵⁾ Throughout all Abhidharma literatures both in Northern and Southern schools,

**Abhidharma-saṃgīti-paryāya-pāda-sāstra* (阿毘達磨集異門足論) is probably the sole example which expounds the four embracing practices as an independent topic (Taisho vol. 26, p. 402c). Its counterpart in Theravada Abhidhamma literatures, the *Dhammasaṅgāni*, does not refer to the topic at all (see the comparative table of these two abhidharmic texts given in 國訳一切經毘曇部 1, p. 23). Later authoritative Theravada treatise *Visuddhimagga* by Buddhaghosa (5c.) does not mention it either. Probably this is because, unlike the four immeasurables (*catvāri apramāṇāni/cattāri appamāṇāni*, see below fn. 7), the four embracing practices do not occupy any place in the system of the meditative practices in Abhidharma.

⁽⁶⁾ As the most important and well-known source, I will cite here a passage from the *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-Śāstra* (MPPŚ) (大智度論), a voluminous commentary on the *Pañcaviṃśatisahasrikā Prajñāpāramitāsūtra* (二万五千頌般若經), ascribed to Nagārjuna (龍樹) (卷六六歎信行品四五 Taisho Vol. 25, 525c-527a): [經 Sūtra] 爾時須菩提白佛言。希有世尊諸多陀阿伽度阿羅呵三藐三佛陀善付諸菩薩摩訶薩事。佛告須菩提。是諸菩薩摩訶薩發阿耨多羅三藐三菩提心，安隱多眾生令無量眾生得樂，憐愍安樂饒益諸天人故。是諸菩薩行菩薩道時以四事攝無量百千眾生，所謂布施愛語利益同事。[論 Śāstra] 利益事者，所謂四攝法，以財施法施二種攝取眾生。愛語有二種，一者隨意愛語，二者隨其所愛法為說。是菩薩未得道，憐愍眾生自破憍慢，隨意說法。若得道隨所應度法為說。高心富人為讚布施，是人能得他物利名聲福德故。若為讚持戒毀咎破戒則心不喜樂。如是等隨其所應而為說法。利益亦有二種，一者今世利後世利為說法，以法治生勤修利事。二者未信教令信，破戒令持戒，寡識令多聞，不施者令布施，癡者教智慧。如是等以善法利益眾生。同事者菩薩教化眾生令行善法同其所行。菩薩善心眾生惡心，能化其惡令同己善。是菩薩以四種攝眾生令住十善道。是廣說四攝義。於二施中法施隨其所樂而為說法，是愛語中第一。眾生愛惜壽命令行十善道則得久壽，利益於一切寶物利中法利最勝，是為利益。同事中同行善法為勝，是菩薩自行十善，亦以教人。

The development of the concept of the four embracing practices from the Mainstream Buddhism to the Mahāyāna and their relation with six perfections are outlined by Michihiko Komine (Komine 1976).

tions, which are taken as benefitting the self, the four embracing practices are identified as the other-benefit practices of instructing sentient beings by means of these perfections. In the case of the *Mahāyāna-sūtrālaṅkāra* (MSA) (大乘莊嚴經論) by Asaṅga (無着 ca. 395-470) and its commentary *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra-bhāṣya* (MSABh) by Vasubandhu (世親 ca. 400-480), which is one of the focuses of this paper, the Bodhisattva is expected to strive for the fulfillment of both self-benefit and other-benefit by means of the six perfections and the four embracing practices after having cultivated benevolence and compassion (慈悲) via the Samādhi of the Four Immeasurables (*catur-apramāṇa* 四無量)⁽⁷⁾. In this sense, the four embracing practices may be interpreted as the embodiment of the mind of benevolence and compassion that has been fostered in meditation. Below, I shall begin by outlining the definition of the four embracing practices encountered in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (BBh) (菩薩地), which is considered as the model of the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra*⁽⁸⁾.

II. The Four Embracing Practices in Mahāyāna Treatises

II.1. The Four Embracing Practices in the *Bodhisattvabhūmi*

The *Bodhisattvabhūmi* 'The Stages of the Bodhisattva' contains two passages that summarize the four embracing practices and that may be viewed as an abbreviated and an extended explanation respectively. The first, which is found in Chapter VIII *Balagotrapaṭala* (力種姓品第八), interprets the four embracing practices as an encapsulation of the three actions of body, speech, and mind that comprise the expedient means of the Bodhisattva, and concisely explains them as the four kinds of skillful means (*upāya* 方便)⁽⁹⁾. The second is Chapter XV *Saṅgrahavastu-paṭala* (攝事品第十

⁽⁷⁾ The [mind of] 'four immeasurables' (*catur-apramāṇa* 四無量[心]) as a practice of meditation are benevolence (*maitrī/ mettā* 慈), compassion (*karuṇā* 悲), sympathetic joy (*muditā* 喜), and equanimity (*upekṣā/ upe[k]khā* 捨). These are also called the four liberations (or rather, concentrations) of mind (*ceto-vimukti/cetovimutti* 四心解脫), or the four divine abodes [in both literal and figurative meaning] (*brahma-vihāra* 四梵住). The last term is often employed in the post-canonical Sanskrit texts and Mahāyāna literatures. See Wakahara, *Compassion without Object: The Four Immeasurables (catur-apramāṇa) in Mahāyāna Buddhism, ORC Research Series 2*, Ryukoku University, Kyoto 2006.

⁽⁸⁾ Concerning these portions of the two treatises, no comprehensive study has been done by modern scholars. In Tibetan Buddhist tradition, Tshon kha pa deals with the six perfections and the four embracing practices in his major work *Lam rims chen mo* mainly based on the relevant chapters of the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (chaps. IX-XV) and the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra* (Chap. XVI).

⁽⁹⁾ *Bodhisattvabhūmi* (BBh), Balagotrapaṭala, Wogihara's ed. (BBhW) 112.10-113.12; Dutt's ed. (BBhD) 79.8-28; Tib. De. 60b5-61a7; Pek. 70b4-71a7; BBh-Vyākhyāna (by Sāgaramegha) De. yi 133a1-b5; 瑜伽師地論卷第三十八 (玄奘譯 Taisho 30, 504c-505a); 菩薩地持經卷第三力種姓品第八 (曇無讖譯 T. 30, 905c); 菩薩善戒經卷第三菩提力性品第九 (求那跋摩譯 T. 20, 976c).

五), which immediately follows the discussion of the six perfections or pāramitā from Chapter IX *Dana* (施品第九) to Chapter XIV *Prajñā* (慧品第十四). As implied by the title, Chapter XV takes the four embracing practices as its subject, treating each separately and in detail⁽¹⁰⁾. The two passages introduced above correspond to Chapters XV *Upāyasahitakarmādhikāra* (業伴品第十六) and XVI *Pāramitādhikāra* (度攝品第十七) of the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra*. Although the organization of the latter work emulates that of the *Bodhisattvabhūmi*, its definition of the four embracing practices is based entirely on the abbreviated explanation found in *BBh* Chapter VIII, and makes no reference to the extended explanation in *BBh* Chapter XV. Hence, the current paper confines itself to translating and introducing the former and foregoes an analysis of the latter in the interests of space and time.

What are the three actions of body, speech, and mind that comprise the expedient means (*upāya* 方便) of Bodhisattvas? If one summarizes them, the four embracing practices (四種攝事) are called the expedient means with regard to Bodhisattvas. As the World-honored One (Bhagavat) expounded, "The Bodhisattva who is endowed with expedient means that encompass the four embracing practices is truly called a Bodhisattva."⁽¹¹⁾

Why, then, are the four embracing practices called expedient means? With regard to instructing and embracing sentient beings, there are, in summary, four kinds of expedient means. Beyond this, there are no more. That is to say 1) benefitting [sentient beings] (*anugrāhaka* 隨攝[方便]), 2) causing [sentient beings] to understand (*grāhaka* 能攝), 3) leading [sentient beings] (*avatāraka* 令入), and 4) causing [sentient beings] to follow faithfully (*anuvartaka* 隨轉).

Among these, 1) 'charity' is the expedient means benefitting [others] from the perspective of the Bodhisattva. This is so because when sentient beings are benefitted via all kinds of donations of material things, they will listen to the words of [the Bodhisattva] and act in accordance with them.

2) Immediately thereafter, the Bodhisattva, by means of 'affectionate speech', causes [sentient beings] to understand, [i.e.] explains, the correct principle [*yukti* 正理; reasoning, or logical argument] in order to remove completely the ignorance

⁽¹⁰⁾ *BBhW* 217-230; *BBhD* 149-158; De. 115b4-123a5, Pek. 129a7-138b5; *BBhVy*, 147b1-210a3; 瑜伽師地論卷第四十三(529c-533a); 菩薩地持經卷第七四攝品第十五(923b-); 菩薩善戒經卷第五軟語品第十六(989b-). Chapters VIII and XV of *BBh* are translated into Japanese with detailed notes by Hideomi Yaita (Yaita 2012 & 2015).

⁽¹¹⁾ *yathoktaṃ Bhagavatā: "catuḥsaṅgrahavastusaṅgrhītenopāyena samanvāgato bodhisattvo bodhisattva ity ucyata"*. Seemingly a citation from a certain Mahāyāna sūtra which I have not succeeded to identify.

of those who are ignorant about this and that. In this way, 'affectionate speech' is expedient means causing [sentient beings] to understand from his [i.e. the Bodhisattva's] perspective.

3) In the same manner, [the Bodhisattva] picks up sentient being that have been instructed and caused to awaken by the correct principle [reasoning] from their unwholesome lot (*akuśala-sthāna* 不善處) in life, and encourages, instructs and introduce them [until] they are safely established⁽¹²⁾ in wholesome surroundings (*kuśala-sthāna* 善處). This is 'beneficial conduct' and the expedient means of leading from his perspective.

4) Similarly, once the Bodhisattva has led these sentient beings, he engages in the same activities alongside them and follows them faithfully, so that when those who ought to be instructed will not say things such as, "If you did not initially equip yourself with pure faith and precepts and charity and wisdom, how are you able to encourage others with regard to these [goals], and how can you order them and cause them to listen to you on the basis of these qualities?" to him⁽¹³⁾. Due to this, you should know that 'acting together' is the fourth expedient means of the Bodhisattva, that of causing [sentient beings] to follow faithfully.

The physical, spoken, and mental actions of the Bodhisattva that are subsumed by these four expedient means, either as a whole or taken one by one, are called [the actions] that comprise the expedient means for the sake of correctly embracing, instructing, maturing sentient beings⁽¹⁴⁾.

In this instance, the four embracing practices and the six perfections are not directly

⁽¹²⁾ samādāpayati vinayati niveśayati pratiṣṭhāpayati; Tib. yang dag par 'dzin du 'jug cing 'dul ba dang 'jog pa dang 'god pa. The phrase is modeled after the following stock phrase encountered often in Nikāya and Āgama: e.g. AN IX.5 Bala (iv.364): etadaggaṃ, bhikkhave, atthacariyānaṃ yadidaṃ assaddhaṃ saddhāsampadāya samādāpeti niveseti patiṭṭhāpeti. dussīlaṃ sīlasampadāya. ... Cf. *SĀ* (雜阿) No. 668 (T. 2, 185a) : 行利最勝者, 謂不信者能令入信建立於信, 立戒者以淨戒, 慳者以施, 惡智者以正智, 令入建立。

⁽¹³⁾ A similar passage with regard to 'charity' (*dāna*) is found in *MPPŚ* (智度論) (卷九一照明品八一 T. 25, 704a-705b): [論 Śāstra] 若不自施, 或有人言, "若施是好法何不自行". 是故菩薩先自布施 (If you do not practice charity, someone might say, "If charity is the right thing, why don't you practice it yourself?" Therefore the Bodhisattva should first practice charity himself).

⁽¹⁴⁾ The four expedient means, i.e., the right actions of the Bodhisattva that comprise the four embracing practices, is to be referred to again as 'the precept associated with the expedient means' (方便相應戒) in *BBh* Chapter 10 *Śīla* (菩薩地戒品) : tatra katamad bodhisattvasya sarvatomukhaṃ śīlaṃ. tac caturvidhaṃ draṣṭavyaṃ. samāttaṃ prakṛtiśīlam abhyastam upāyayuktaṃ ca. ... tatedam upāyayuktaṃ śīlaṃ yac catvāri saṃgrahavastūni niśritya bodhisattvasya sattveṣu kuśalaṃ kāyavākkarma pravartate. (*BBhW* 184.6-12; *BBhD* 127.5); 云何菩薩一切門戒, 當知此戒略有四種: 一者正受戒, 二者本性戒, 三者串習戒, 四者方便相應戒. ... 方便相應戒者, 謂諸菩薩依四攝事於諸有情身語善業恒相續轉. (T. 522a)

linked to each other. Similarly, in the case of *BBh* Chapter XV, the relationship between the four embracing means and the six perfections is not clearly stated (though Chapter XV is, of course, located immediately after the chapters on the various perfections or *pāramitā* in the text). In addition, there are no references to the perfections as the concrete content of the true teaching or dharma in the section of *BBh* Chapter VIII that lists the twenty characteristics of the Bodhisattva expounding the true dharma.

II.2. The Definition of the Four Embracing Practices in the "Chapter on the Perfections" (Chap. XVI) of the *Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra*

Although the root text of Chap. XVI of the *Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra* 'The Ornament of the Mahāyāna Scriptures' follows the *Bodhisattvabhūmi* in expounding the six perfections (vv. 1-71) and four embracing practices (vv. 72-78) as a single sequence, it differs from the latter text insofar as it clarifies the relationship between these two groups and includes important comments that cannot be derived from the *Bodhisattvabhūmi*. In what follows, I shall provide a rendering of the root verse (*Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra*, *MSA*) and the prose commentary (*Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra-Bhāṣya*, *MSABh*) of the relevant section and provide analysis while summarizing the interpretations of further sub-commentaries by Asvabhāva (無性 6 c.) and Sthiramati (安慧 470-550)⁽¹⁵⁾. Incidentally, while there are other references to the four embracing practices scattered throughout the text, I will forego an examination of them here, as none of them constitute actual explanations of the four embracing practices *per se*⁽¹⁶⁾.

Seven verses concerning the embracing practices (follow as vv. 72-78).

The embracing practices are four: charity, affectionate speech, beneficial conduct, and acting together. With regard to these:

Charity is the same [as above], while affectionate speech, beneficial conduct, and acting together are considered to be teaching them [to others], encouraging [others to practice them], and following them faithfully oneself. (*MSA* XVI-72)

Charity is considered the same as in the case of the [six] perfections (*pāramitā*).

⁽¹⁵⁾ Lévi's ed. 116.1-117.21; MS. National Archives No.119 (vi. 99, la. tR. 291) 90a4-91a3; Tib. De. No. 4026 phi 209b5-210b7; Pek. No. 5527 phi 229b4-231a3; Asvabhāva's *Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra-ṭīkā* (*MSAṬ*), De. No. 4029 bi 130a4-130b7, Pek. No. 5530 bi 146b3-147b1; Sthiramati's *Sūtrāṃkāra-vṛtti-bhāṣya* (*SAVBh*), De. No. 4034 tsi 43b2-46b6; Pek. No. 5531 tsi 50b6-54b6; K. Bhattacharya, For a New Edition of the *Mahāyānasūtrāṃkāra*, *Journal of the Nepal Research Centre* Vol. XII, 2001, Kathmandu, pp. 5-16.

⁽¹⁶⁾ For instance, Chap IV, vv. 15-20; Chap XI, v. 64; Chap XVIII, vv. 69-70. Incidentally, another important treatise of the Yogācāra School, *Mahāyāna-Saṅgraha* (攝大乘論), gives only a very brief account of the four embracing practices.

Affectionate speech refers to the teaching of them, and beneficial conduct refers to encouraging [others] towards them. Since the word 'them' implies the [six] perfections, the meaning of [this sentence] is "teaching the perfections, and encouraging [others] towards the perfections." Acting together means to faithfully follow oneself that which one encourages of others. (*MSABh*)

Concerning the reason why the four embracing practices are expounded after the six perfections in the root text, Asvabhāva states that, "Since the cultivation of the six perfections leads the Bodhisattva to achieve the Buddha-dharma, they benefit the self. Since the embracing practices [lead all sentient beings towards attainment, and therefore] benefit others, the chapter on the embracing practices [was expounded], it being by means of the four embracing practices that one engages in benefitting others" (130a4-5; 146b4-5). Given that this anticipates the gist of the final verse of the root text (v. 79 below), this interpretation may be considered valid. The identification of charity as the first of the four embracing practices with the perfection of charity, the first of the six perfections, is borne out by both Asvabhāva's analysis of the definition of charity (consisting of ten items) as a whole in his discussion of the paramitas in the previous section of the root text, as well as by Sthiramati's interpretation of the four characteristics of charity in verse 8 of the same text⁽¹⁷⁾. Although this is not the place to analyze this matter in detail, categorizations such as the three types of charity, i.e. charity of material goods (財施), of the Dharma (法施), and of fearlessness (無畏施) (XVI-17, 52), as well as the purity of the three aspects of charity, i.e. donor, recipient and benefactions (三輪清淨), based on non-discriminating wisdom (XVI-30, 52), were surely important for establishing the relationship between the four embracing practices and the six perfections⁽¹⁸⁾.

As far as affectionate speech, defined in the text as "teaching the perfections," is concerned, Sthiramati comments that, "demonstrating to others the distinctive characteristics and shared characteristics of the six perfections from charity to wis-

⁽¹⁷⁾ [For the Bodhisattva] Charity cures the disease [of covetousness], is endowed with the wisdom of non-discrimination, fulfills all desire, and matures sentient beings in three ways [i.e. into three vehicles] (*MSA* XVI-8 : *dānaṃ vipakṣahīnaṃ jñānena gataṃ ca nirvikalpena / sarveccḥāparipūrakaṃ api sattvavipācakaṃ tredhā //*). These four characteristics apply to all of the six perfections (*ibid.* vv. 8-13).

⁽¹⁸⁾ Definite statement on the vital linkage between the four embracing practices and the six perfections is, for instance, given in *MPPŚ* (智度論) and in the *Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra* cited and commented on therein: (卷八九"四攝品" 七八之餘 T. 25, 685a): [經 Sūtra] 須菩提, 菩薩摩訶薩以二施攝取眾生, 所謂財施法施, 是為菩薩希有難及事. 云何為菩薩摩訶薩愛語攝取眾生, 菩薩摩訶薩以六波羅蜜為眾生說法作是言, "汝行六波羅蜜攝一切善法". 云何為菩薩摩訶薩利行攝取眾生, 菩薩摩訶薩長夜教眾生令行六波羅蜜. 云何為菩薩摩訶薩同事攝取眾生, 菩薩摩訶薩以五神通力故種種變化入五道中與眾生同事. 以此四事而攝取之。

dom by means of logical reason (*gtan tshig*, **hetu*) constitutes the characteristic of affectionate speech" (43b3-4; 50b8-51a1). While this interpretation appears to be based on the definition of affectionate speech as "an expedient means instructing [sentient beings] and causing them to understand the correct principle (*yukti* 正理)" in the above-mentioned Chapter VIII of the *BBh*, it is exceedingly interesting that logic/logical reasoning, that is to say inference (*anumāṇa* 比量) (or at least the practice of 'inference for others' [*parārthānumāṇa* 為他比量] that was considered part of it), was viewed by the Yogācāra tradition as affectionate speech.

Why, then, are the embracing practices considered to consist of these four?
Vis-à-vis others:

You should know that these four embracing practices are expedient means of benefitting, causing understanding, encouraging, and causing to follow faithfully. (*MSA XVI-73*)

Charity is an expedient means of benefitting, since physical benefit arises due to material offerings. Affectionate speech is an expedient means causing understanding since it causes [others] to comprehend matters (=the perfections) that are unclear or that are being doubted. Beneficial conduct is an expedient means for encouraging, since it urges [others] towards what is wholesome (=the perfections). Acting together is an expedient means for causing to follow faithfully, since once others know that the words and actions of the one encouraging them match each other, they faithfully follow him to the wholesomeness that he is encouraging them towards. (*MSABh*)

This root verse, which identifies the four types of expedient means as the reason why the embracing practices are also four in number, is based upon the passage in Chapter VIII of the *BBh* identifying the four embracing practices as the four expedient means that we have already examined above. In addition, it also corresponds on many points with the description of the 'precepts benefitting sentient beings' located in Chapter X *Śīla* (戒品) of the *BBh* (see also the commentary to verse 77 below). According to Sthiramati, the "expedient means of benefitting," that is to say charity, means "to physically benefit sentient beings by giving them food, clothing, and so forth, so that they will not suffer from hunger, cold, and the like." (44a3-4; 51b1-2)

Due to the first, one becomes receptive, due to the second one gains faith,

Due to the third, one practices, and due to the fourth, one purifies. (*MSA XVI-74*)

Since one becomes a follower of the teaching⁽¹⁹⁾ via material offerings, one be-

⁽¹⁹⁾ According to Tibetan translation, "Since one becomes suitable to listen to the teaching ([*chos*]

comes receptive. Since one clarifies it [i.e. the teaching] and cuts off doubts via affectionate speech, one gains faith in the teaching. Due to beneficial conduct, one practices in accordance with the teaching. Since one acts accordingly over a long period of time due to acting together, one purifies one's practice. The above are the functions of the [four] embracing practices. (*MSABh*)

While the action of 'acting together' is explained, "since one acts accordingly over a long period of time due to acting together, one purifies one's practice," the two sub-commentaries differ in their interpretation of this passage. Asvabhāva states, "Since one knows the encouraging person (= the Bodhisattva) is a man whose words and actions match each other and respects him for a long period of time, one [thereby] purifies one's practices" (130b1; 146b7-8). In other words, due to seeing the Bodhisattva practicing the perfections himself (i.e. being engaged in 'acting together'), sentient beings follow the Bodhisattva for a long period of time, thereby purifying their own practice of the perfections. By contrast, Sthiramati interprets this passage as "meaning that in order to firmly establish sentient beings in the practice of the perfections, [the Bodhisattva] practices the perfections himself over a long period of time, whereupon the characteristics of the perfections become stainless and pure" (45a1-2; 52b1-3). He thus takes the subject that practices for a long period of time and purifies the perfections to be the Bodhisattva himself. Based on the context of the root verse, the former interpretation appears the more plausible one. Incidentally, the purification of the practice of the perfections is explained in concrete detail in Sthiramati's commentary to the next verse.

The four embracing practices may also be considered as two embrasures;
A material (*āmiṣa*) embrasure and a dharma embrasure that consists of the
[three] dharma of objects, and so forth. (*MSA XVI-75*)

A separate set of two embracing practices consisting of a material embrasure (*āmiṣa-saṅgraha* 財攝) and a dharma embrasure (dharma-saṅgraha 法攝) was expounded by the World-honored One. The four embracing practices are included in these two. The first derives from the material embrasure, while the remaining [three] derive from the dharma embrasure. In addition, these [three] derive from the dharma of objects (*ālabhāna*), the dharma of practices (*pratipatti*), and the dharma of their purification (*viśuddhi*), respectively. (*MSABh*)

The scripture expounding the two embracing practices that the text refers to is identified with the following sūtra:

Oh, Monks, there are two embrasures. What are these two? [They are] the material

nyan du btub par byed pa'i phyir)

embrasure (*āmiṣa-saṅgaha*) and the dharma embrasure (*dhamma-saṅgaha*). Oh, Monks, these are the two embrasures. Oh, Monks, among these two embrasures, the dharma embrasure is the most excellent. (*AN II.13.8 Saṅgahā*)⁽²⁰⁾

Here, the text bestows a unique interpretation upon the two embrasure expounded in the Āgamas in order to reconcile them with the definition of the four embracing practices that it has already provided. The material embrasure corresponds to the embracing practice of charity. Amongst the dharma of objects, the dharma of practices, and the dharma of their purification that make up the dharma embrasure, the dharma of objects (i.e. the "teaching of the [six] perfections" [Asvabhāva] or the "scriptures associated with the six perfections, and so forth" [Sthiramati]) corresponds to affectionate speech, the dharma of practices (i.e. practices of extolling the six perfections) corresponds to beneficial conduct, and the dharma of their purification (i.e. purification of the practice of the six perfections) corresponds to acting together, respectively. Purification, according to Sthiramati, refers to "separating the perfections from those which are to be cured (*vipakṣa* 对治) such as covetousness, and so forth"⁽²¹⁾ (45a7; 53a2).

You should know that the embracing [practices] are divided into inferior, mediocre, and superior, as well as into mostly non-beneficial, mostly beneficial, and completely beneficial. (*MSA XVI-76*)

This is a distinction between different types of embracing [practices]. Among these, you should know that the embracing [practices] of the Bodhisattva is inferior, mediocre, and superior with regard to those who cultivate the three vehicles, respectively. It is mostly non-beneficial at the [preparatory] stage of practicing

⁽²⁰⁾ masaṅgaho ca. ime kho bhikkhave dve saṅgahā. etadaggaṃ bhikkhave imesaṃ dvinnāṃ saṅgahānaṃ yadidaṃ dhammasaṅgahoti. Cf. *Ekottara Āgama* (增壹阿含經)15.5 [恩] (T. 2, 577b) : "聞如是 ... 爾時世尊告諸比丘, 有此二恩云何為二所謂法恩財恩. 恩中之上者所謂不過法恩也. 是故諸比丘當修行法恩. 如是諸比丘當作是學... ". See also a similar context in *MPPŚ* (智度論) (卷八八四攝品第七八 T. 679b- 682c): [經 Sūtra] 復次須菩提, 我以佛眼觀十方世界如恒河沙等國土中諸菩薩摩訶薩. 以四事攝取眾生. 何等為四, 布施愛語利益同事. 云何菩薩以布施攝取眾生. 須菩提, 菩薩以二種施攝取眾生, 財施法施. ... 法施有二種, 一者世間二者出世間, ... 菩薩摩訶薩因世間法施得出世間法施. 如是須菩提, 菩薩摩訶薩教眾生令得世間法已, 以方便力教令得出世間法. [論 Śāstra] 人以四事攝之, 布施愛語利益同事. 布施有二事, 如經中廣說 ... 問曰, 若爾者於四事中何以多說布施, 餘三略說? 答曰, 布施中攝三事故. 以財施法施教化眾生則無所不攝. 復次四事中初廣開布施, 則知餘三亦如是. 問曰, 若爾者何以略說財施而廣說法施? 答曰, 財施少法施廣故 ...

⁽²¹⁾ The six perfections respectively serve as the cures for the following six maladies which are listed in the vv. 8-13 of this chapter: charity (*dāna* 布施) for covetousness (*mātsarya* 慳貪), precept (*sīla* 持戒) for transgression (*daṭṭh-sīlya* 惡戒 [犯戒]), forbearance (*kṣānti* 忍辱) for anger (*krodha* 瞋恚), effort (*vīrya* 精進) for indolence (*kausīdya* 懈怠), concentration (*dhyāna* 禪定) for distraction (*vikṣepa* 散亂) and wisdom (*prajñā* 智慧) for stupidity (*daṣ-prajñya* 惡慧).

with [rudimentary] understanding (*adhimukticyā-bhūmi* 信解行地). It is mostly beneficial in the case of those who have entered the [final] stages (i.e. ten *bhūmi*). It is completely beneficial at the eighth stage and beyond, since [the Bodhisattva on these stages] will unfailingly accomplish the benefitting of sentient beings. (*MSABh*)

Since Sthiramati's commentary on this root verse is particularly detailed, I shall quote it in full here:

By means of the verse "... are divided into inferior, mediocre, and superior," (v. 76a) and so forth, the different types of the four embracing practices are explained. Among these, the four embracing practices of voice-hearers (or disciples, *śrāvaka*) are said to be inferior, as they do not engage in benefitting others. The four embracing practices of solitary awakeners (*pratyekabuddha*) are said to be mediocre, as they are equipped with the mediocre roots, such as the root of faith (*dad pa la sogs pa'i dbang po bar ma*). The four embracing practices of Bodhisattvas are said to be superior, as they practice both improving oneself and bringing benefit to others. Alternatively, the four embracing practices by means of which the Bodhisattva takes sentient beings and places them on the vehicle of the voice-hearers are said to be inferior. If he uses the four embracing practices to take sentient beings and place them on the vehicle of the solitary awakeners, these four embracing practices are said to be mediocre. If he uses the four embracing practices to take sentient beings and place them on the great vehicle, these four embracing practices are said to be superior.

"You should know that the [four] embracing [practices] are those that are mostly non-beneficial, those that are mostly beneficial, and that are completely beneficial" (v. 76cd) means that when Bodhisattvas abiding at the stage of practicing with [rudimentary] understanding (mos pas spyod pa'i gnas skabs, **adhimuktyavasthā/ adhimukticyā-bhūmi* 信解行地) take sentient beings and [attempt to] cause them to mature by means of the four embracing practices, only a few will mature, while most will not. Hence, [their practices] are said to be non-beneficial for most [beings]. Since, having not seen the truth of the Dharma, they do not know the aspirations of sentient beings, [their practices] are meaningless for most [beings]. When Bodhisattvas from the first stage to the seventh stage take sentient beings and [attempt to] cause them to mature by means of the four embracing practices, most will mature, while only a few will not. Hence, [their practices] are said to be beneficial for most [beings], which means that they are meaningful for most [beings]. When Bodhisattvas on the eighth, ninth and tenth stages take sentient beings and

cause them to mature by means of the four embracing practices, all (sentient beings) become matured as they (Bodhisattvas) cause them to mature, and no single (sentient being) is spoiled (*chud mi za ba*, **a-vipranāśā*). Hence, you should know that [their four embracing practices] are completely beneficial for most [beings]

While the rigorous distinction between the three vehicles is a characteristic feature of this treatise, verse 69 of this chapter also divides the perfection of effort (*vīrya* 精進) into the same three categories of inferior, mediocre, and superior, which are then explicitly linked with the three vehicles, with the two vehicles being said to be self-benefiting, and the great vehicle identified as benefitting others.

This method is relied upon by [all those] working to gather an assembly, [And it] is praised as assisting in accomplishing all benefits for all [beings], and being an expedient means of happiness. (*MSA XVI-77*)

All who work to gather an assembly rely solely upon this expedient means, that is to say, the four embracing practices. For this reason, it is praised as "assisting in accomplishing all benefits for all [beings], and being an expedient means of happiness" by the myriad Buddhas. (*MSABh*)

Sentient beings who have either been embraced, will be embraced, or are currently being embraced,

They all are [to be embraced] in this way [i.e., by means of the four embracing practices], therefore this is the [only] path causing sentient beings to mature.

(*MSA XVI-78*)

This shows that the four embracing practices are the only path (*ekāyana*) causing sentient beings to mature across the three times; for there is no other path. (*MSABh*)

These two verses, which go so far as to identify the four embracing practices as the only path benefitting all sentient beings and causing them to mature, clearly demonstrate the immense importance that the root treatise places upon the four embracing practices. The fact that both verses draw on what appears to have been the most popular scripture expounding the four embracing means, the *Āṭṭhaka Sutta* (手長者經), makes it clear that they are intended to function as a pair. The actual source being referred to is the following passage from this same scripture⁽²²⁾:

⁽²²⁾ AN VIII.24 (iv. 219) *Āṭṭhaka* (2): *sādhu sādhu āṭṭhaka, yoni kho tyāyaṃ āṭṭhaka, mahatiṃ parisam saṅgahetuṃ, ye pi hi keci āṭṭhaka atītam addhānaṃ mahatiṃ parisam saṅgahesuṃ, sabbe te imeheva catūhi saṅgahavatthūhi mahatiṃ parisam saṅgahesuṃ. ye hi keci āṭṭhaka anāgtaṃ addhānaṃ ... saṅgaṇhissanti. ye pi hi keci āṭṭhaka etarahi ... saṅgaṇhantīti. ... Cf. MĀ 中阿含經(四十)手長者經(T. 1, 482c) : 善哉善哉手長者, 汝能以如法攝於大眾. 又以如門攝於大眾. 以如因緣攝於大眾. 手長者, 若過去有沙門梵志以如法攝大眾者, 彼一切即*

Oh Hatthaka, that is correct, that is how it is. Oh Hatthaka, this is truly the entrance (= expedient means) for embracing the huge assembly (of sentient beings). Oh Hatthaka, those who embraced the huge assembly in the past all embraced the huge assembly by means of the four embracing practices. Oh Hatthaka, those who will embrace the huge assembly in the future will all. ... Oh Hatthaka, those who are embracing the huge assembly in the present are all. ...

While the author borrows the authority of the Scripture or Āgama to emphasize the relevance of the four embracing practices and recommend their practice, insofar as the four embracing practices being discussed here are, of course, an adaptation that has been fused with the teaching of the six perfections, the real intention of the author should be understood as the "gathering in of the assembly" or "maturation of sentient beings" into the great vehicle by means of "the expedient means of happiness", i. e. the four embracing practices.

While the above concludes the definition of the four embracing practices in the root text, I would also like to include and analyze the final verse that concludes this chapter.

Thus, one [i.e. the Bodhisattva] who possesses a mind that is constantly unattached to wealth, has mastered quiescence, restraint, and diligence, has stabilized his self,

And does not discriminate the characteristics of existence and objects, is the one who embraces the multitude of sentient beings. (MSA XVI-79)

This (verse) shows the genuine cultivation of the four embracing practices of the Bodhisattva who dwells in the afore-mentioned perfections, since it is due to the perfections that he achieves self-benefit, and it is due to the embracing practices that he achieves benefitting others, respectively.

End of the "Chapter on the Perfections" of the *Mahāyānasūtrālaṅkāra* (MSABh)

This verse serves to bind together the root text in its entirety, as is evident from the special meter *puṣpītāgrā* that is frequently encountered in the concluding verse at the end of each chapter of the root treatise. We see that the commentary takes the six perfections as benefitting the self and the four embracing practices as benefitting others. This appears to be due to a passage in the *BBh* that summarizes the perfections and embracing practices by stating that "by means of the six perfections, one matures oneself with regard to the Buddha-dharma, and by means of the four embracing practices, [one causes] the maturation of all sentient beings."⁽²³⁾

此四事攝於中或有餘。手長者，若有未來... 若有現在...

⁽²³⁾ *BBhW* (227.3-7): tatra yac ca dānam anekavidhaṃ nirdiṣṭaṃ yac ca śīlaṃ vistareṇa yāvad

Sthiramati explains this as "in this way, a Bodhisattva who has caused himself to mature via the practice of the six perfections causes other sentient beings to mature by means of the four embracing practices. Therefore, when it is said (in the verse 79 above) that "one is the one who embraces the multitude of sentient beings", this means that a Bodhisattva equipped with these perfections is one who causes sentient beings to mature by means of the four embracing practices."(46b5-6-; 54b4-6)

Needless to say that the six perfections originally constituted the practice of the Bodhisattva, and that they were therefore a practice leading to the perfection of both self-benefit and benefitting others. Even in the present treatise, that the six perfections benefit others while also benefitting oneself and that there is no distinction between benefitting self and others from the perspective of the Bodhisattva is repeatedly emphasized. For example, in verse 16, it is stated that "sentient beings are benefitted (*anugraha*)" by each of the six perfections from charity to wisdom. The "benefitting-others" aspect of the perfections is especially emphasized in verse 4, which proclaims, "The self-benefit of the Bodhisattva is based upon this benefitting of others (that constitutes the practice of the six perfections); this is because [the Bodhisattva] makes the aspirations of others his own, and he is able to attain Great Enlightenment or Mahābodhi [himself via the practice of benefitting others]." ⁽²⁴⁾

As pointed out above, according to the root treatise, the four embracing practices entail benefitting sentient beings via the practice of charity, followed by teaching them the perfections, encouraging them, and taking the lead oneself in putting [the perfections] into practice alongside others. Therefore, in this case, when the perfections are viewed as one's own practice, they are called self-benefitting (striving upwards towards Bodhi or Enlightenment 上求菩提), while the role played by the four embracing practices in causing sentient beings to mature via the transmission and sharing of these very same six perfections causes them to be labelled as "benefitting others" (reaching

yā ca samānārthatā. tatra pāramitābhir adhyātmaṃ buddhadharmaparipākaḥ, saṅgrahavastu-bhis sarvasattvapariṇākaḥ. samāsato bodhisattvasyaitat kuśalānāṃ dharmānāṃ karma veditavyaṃ. 如是已說多種施戒廣說乃至最後同事。其中所有波羅蜜多能自成熟一切佛法。所有攝事能成熟他一切有情。當知略說菩薩一切善法作業 [T. 532b]. These statements in the Yogācāra treatises are, in turn, based on the *Prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*. See, for instance, *MPPŚ* 智度論(卷七六夢中不證品六一 T. 597a-598b): [經 Sūtra] 以是故須菩提, 菩薩摩訶薩欲得阿耨多羅三藐三菩提淨佛世界成就眾生, 當學六波羅蜜三十七道法, 及四攝法攝取眾生。何等四, 布施愛語利益同事。須菩提, 以是利益故我言六波羅蜜及三十七道法是諸菩薩摩訶薩世尊是道是大明... [論 Śāstra] 是六波羅蜜等是自利法。行者欲以六波羅蜜教化眾生淨佛世界, 應以四攝法攝取眾生。四攝法義如先說。如自利利他故, 佛說六波羅蜜三十七品等諸法是世尊是道等。

⁽²⁴⁾ *MSABh* ad *MSA* XVI-4 (Lévi p.99, ll.19-20): etasmāt parārthāt bodhisattvasyātmārtho bhavati/ parakāryasvakāryatvān mahābodhiprāptitāś ca.

down to save sentient beings 下化衆生). In addition, the six perfections are synonymous with the Great Vehicle. Hence, the root treatise appears to be trying to draw attention to the fact that the diffusion of the Great Vehicle, Mahāyāna, is an important duty of the Bodhisattva through its exaltation of the four embracing practices.

It goes without saying that the lack of attachment to wealth, [mastery of] quiescence, restraint, diligence, stabilization of the self, and [cognition] lacking in discrimination that appear in the verses stand for the six perfections of charity, precept, forbearance, effort, concentration, and wisdom, respectively. The first five of these are fairly unproblematic, but the phrase "does not discriminate the characteristics of existence and objects (*bhava-viṣaya-nimitta-nirvikalpa*)," which refers to the perfection of wisdom or *prajñāpāramitā*, is without parallel in the remainder of the work, and hence difficult to interpret. According to Asavbhāva's commentary, it means "not discriminating between the two characteristics of existence, that is to say the various internal elements or dharma (*nang gi chos rnam*), and objects, that is to say the various phenomena existing externally (*phyi rol gyi dngos po rnam*)" (130b6-7; 147a7-8). Similarly, Sthiramati interprets, " 'existence' refers to what is present internally, that is to say, the five constituent elements or skandha, while 'object' means what is present externally, that is to say, matter or *rūpa* and so forth. 'Characteristics' refers to the two types of presence, both internal and external. This means that one [=the Bodhisattva] does not discriminate other sentient beings that do not belong to one's own stream of mind (*bdag gi gyud las ma gtogs pa*) as genuinely existing" (46b4-5; 54b3-4). Although the wording of these two commentators is slightly different, the gist of their arguments is same: the annihilation of subject-object dichotomy or self-other discrimination.

In the root text, the perfection of wisdom is referred to as 'non-discriminating wisdom', as well as 'pervasive wisdom in accordance with the truth of all actions' (which causes actions to be without cognitive distortion), 'purity from cognitive obstructions', and 'penetration into the selflessness of constituent elements or dharma'. Since this non-discriminating wisdom is taken to accompany all of the six perfections (for example, it forms the foundation for the purity of the three aspects in the case of charity, i.e. donor, recipient and benefactions), it would appear that it is the non-discriminating wisdom in the sense of the equality between self and others that is particularly emphasized in the present context. Indeed, it might be argued that here is given one response to the question of how compassion, which necessarily presupposes the existence of others, is possible within the Yogācāra system that is often interpreted as a form of solipsism: "Compassion is possible precisely because others do not exist".

III. Dogen's Exposition of the Four Embracing Practices in *The Shobogenzo*

Dogen (道元 1200-1253) wrote an important and unique essay titled "The Four Embracing Practices of a Bodhisattva" (菩提薩埵四攝法 *Bodaisatta Shi-shobo*)⁽²⁵⁾ on *Tango no hi* (端午日) or the fifth day of the fifth lunar month (May 24) in the fourth year of *Ninji* (仁治) (CE 1243) when he was at the age of forty-four. The essay was later incorporated in his main work *The Shobogenzo* (正法眼藏 *The Treasury of the Eye of the True Dharma*) as Chapter XLV⁽²⁶⁾, but in the colophon of the essay, unlike most of the other chapters of the book, no mention is given about either the place or the audience to be addressed. This might suggest that it was not supposed to be an open discourse for his disciples. It also differs from other chapters in terms of content. Instead of the metaphysical speculation in abstruse style which makes up most of the work, here we are led into an intimate conversation with the author who freely refers to historical events, legends and parables.

After prefacing the essay with the enumeration of the four embracing practices as "The first is charity. The second is affectionate speech. The third is beneficial conduct. The fourth is acting together,"⁽²⁷⁾ he expounds each practice one by one. Due to space limitation I will only deal with the portion of the first practice, charity, which is the longest, most detailed and significant.

'Charity' means not being covetous (不貪)⁽²⁸⁾. Not being covetous means not being greedy. Not being greedy means, in everyday language, not courting favor. Even if we rule over the four great continents [as a Cakravartin or universal king], if we want to bestow the teaching of the right truth, we simply must not be covetous. That might mean, for example, bestowing upon strangers treasures that are to be thrown away. When we offer flowers from distant mountains to the Tathāgata (如来), and when we donate treasures accumulated in our past life to sentient be-

⁽²⁵⁾ Here Dogen does not refer to the four embracing practices as *Shi-sho-ji* (四攝事) but as *Shi-sho-bo* (四攝法), which, together with other evidences, may reveal that his main source was *MPPŚ* (智度論).

⁽²⁶⁾ The chapter number is that of the standard edition, i.e., so-called "Ninety-five volumes edition" (九十五卷本). Here I put aside the complicated problem of various recensions of the *Shobogenzo*. In addition to the original Japanese, I consulted the following three English translations available to me: Kosen Nishiyama tr., *A Complete English Translation of Dogen Zenji's Shobogenzo (The Eye and Treasury of the True Law)*, Vol. III, Tokyo 1975; Gudo Wafu Nishijima and Chodo Cross tr., *Shobogenzo: The True Dharma-Eye Treasury*, Vol. III, BDK English Tripitaka Series, Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, 2007; Hubert Nearman tr., "*SHOBOGENZO The Treasure House of the Eye of the True Teaching*" by *Eihei Dogen*, Order of Buddhist Contemplatives, Shasta Abbey Press, Mount Shasta, California 2007

⁽²⁷⁾ 一者布施, 二者愛語, 三者利行, 四者同事.

⁽²⁸⁾ See above fn. 17 and 21.

ings, whether [the gift] is Dharma or material objects, in each case we are originally endowed with the virtue that accompanies charity. It is natural that even though such things are not something that we personally own, it does not hinder our offering them as charity.⁽²⁹⁾ And the humbleness of such offerings is not to be despised, for it is the sincerity of these meritorious deeds that counts. . . . The direct and indirect influences of this charity pervade far into the heavens above and through the human world, even reaching the wise and the saintly who have experienced the effect [i.e. enlightenment]. This is because when these beings have become donor and recipient, they have already formed a link [as such] with each other.

The Buddha says, "When a donor comes into an assembly, all present admire that person from the beginning [and they rejoice]."⁽³⁰⁾ Remember, the mind of such a person is tacitly understood. So we should offer even a single word or a single verse of Dharma as charity [i.e. the charity of teachings (法施)], and it will become a good seed in this life and in other lives. We should offer even a single penny or a single grass-stalk as charity [i.e. the charity of material goods (財施)], and it will sprout a good root in this age and in other ages. Dharma can be wealth, and material goods can be Dharma, it may depend upon [people's] wish.

Truly, bestowing one's beard on another once put someone's mind in order, and an offering of a few grains of sand once gained someone the rank of king⁽³¹⁾. Such donors covet no reward, but just share according to their ability. Providing a ferry or building a bridge is precisely the perfection [*pāramī-tā*, or a way to the Other Shore, *pāram-itā* (到彼岸)⁽³²⁾] of charity. When we have learned well what charity means, both receiving the body [i.e. birth into this world] and giving up the body [i.e. leaving this world] are charity. Earning a living and doing productive work are originally nothing other than charity. . . .

⁽²⁹⁾ This refers to the giving of something that does not have any owner, such as the Dharma, or the grains of sand on a beach which a child once offered. These types of offering are beyond the concept of 'ownership'.

⁽³⁰⁾ Paraphrased by Dogen in Japanese from vol. 24 of *Ekottara Āgama* 增壹阿含經卷二四 (Taisho vol. 2, p. 681a): 檀越施主若至沙門刹利婆羅門長者衆中, ..., 檀越施主衆人敬仰見者歡喜.

⁽³¹⁾ The former refers to the story recorded in Chinese classical history *Tang Shu* (唐書) that when an officer named Li Ji (李勣) in the court of the Emperor Tai Zong (太宗 reign 627-649) of the Tang (唐) dynasty fell sick and needed the ashes from a beard for medicine, the emperor burned his own beard and gave the ashes to the officer. The latter is adopted from a well-known episode in the *Sutra of King Aśoka* (阿育王經) (T. vol.50, p. 132a-b): A child who was playing in the sand when the Buddha came by on an almsround. The child put an offering of sand into the Buddha's almsbowl, and by virtue of this act he later became King Aśoka.

⁽³²⁾ *Pāramitā* was traditionally thus interpreted in the Northern Buddhist school.

Truly, it is because we have inherited the merit from having offered charity in past lives that we have obtained the human body we now have. . . . When we can give up even one speck of dust for charity though it is our own act we will quietly rejoice in it, because we will have already received the authentic transmission of one of the virtues of the Buddhas, and because for the first time we will be practicing one of the methods of a Bodhisattva.

What is truly hard to change is the mind of sentient beings. By starting with one offering we begin to change the mental state of sentient beings, after which we resolve to change it until they attain Enlightenment. At the outset we should necessarily resort to the practice of charity. This is why the first of the six perfections is the perfection of charity. The size of mind is beyond measurement, and the size of things is also beyond measurement. Be that as it may, at times the mind changes things, and at times things change the mind, which is none other than the practice of charity.

With regard to the essay, many of modern authors often refer to the 'originality' or 'uniqueness' of Dogen⁽³³⁾. However, a major portion of his exposition of the four embracing practices is rather orthodox, based mainly on those Mahayana sutras and treatises, part of which we have seen in the preceding sections of this paper. His ingenuity can better be seen, for example, in the effective and convincing way he cites from Chinese classics and Buddhist texts as illustrative examples and scriptural authority. But what is really impressive is his brief, abrupt, and assertive comments given after such traditional and orthodox explanations.

When, after reading the last portion of the first paragraph "This is because when these beings have become donor and recipient, they have already formed a link [as such] with each other", we come across with the last sentence of the second paragraph, "Dharma can be wealth, and material goods can be Dharma," and again encounter with the very last sentence of this section, "at times the mind changes things, and at times things change the mind, which is none other than the practice of charity," we notice that Master Dogen is suggesting the possibility of a completely new form of human relationships: relationships based on 'giving' where materiality and spirituality are intermingled or interchangeable. Or when we hear him say in the third paragraph, "When we have learned well what charity means, both receiving the body and giving up the body are charity. Earning a living and doing productive work are originally nothing

⁽³³⁾ For instance, a famous Japanese scholar who translated the *Shobogenzo* into modern Japanese with useful annotations quotes the beginning sentence " 'Charity' means not being covetous (不貪), " given above, and remarks with admiration, "We have never heard any explanation about Charity like this! Wherever are such words from?"

other than charity," we will see our birth, life and death in a totally different perspective: new light is shed on our day-to-day life, and it is given meaningfulness⁽³⁴⁾.

Bibliography

- Morris, R. and Hardy, H. eds., *Aṅguttara-nikāya*, 5 Vols., 1885-1900, Pali Text Society, London (rep. 1979-1995).
- Rhys Davids, T. W. and Carpenter, J. E. eds., *Dīgha-nikāya*, 3 Vols., 1889-1910, Pali Text Society, London (rep. 1995-2007).
- Walleser, Max and Kopp, Hermann eds., *Manorathapūranī: Buddhaghosa's commentary on the Aṅguttara-nikāya*, 3 Vols., Pali Text Society, London, 1924-1936.
- Dutt, Nalinaksha ed., *Bodhisattva-bhūmi, Being the XVth Section of Asaṅgapāda's Yogācārabhūmi*, K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute, Patna, 1966 (2nd ed. 1978).
- Wogihara, Unrai ed., *Bodhisattva-bhūmi: A Statement of Whole Course of the Bodhisattva (Being Fifteenth Section of Yogācārabhūmi)*, Seigo Kenkyukai, Tokyo 1936 (rep. 1971).
- Lévi, Sylvain ed., *Mahāyāna-sūtrālaṅkāra*, Tome I et II, Honoré Champion, Paris, 1907 (rep. Kyoto 1983).
- Nearman, Hubert tr., *SHOBOGENZO The Treasure House of the Eye of the True Teaching" by Eihei Dogen*, Order of Buddhist Contemplatives, Shasta Abbey Press, Mount Shasta, California 2007.
- Nishijima, Gudo Wafu and Cross, Chodo tr., *Shobogenzo: The True Dharma-Eye Treasury*, Vol. III, BDK English Tripitaka Series, Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, 2007.
- Nishiyama, Kosen tr., *A Complete English Translation of Dogen Zenji's Shobogenzo (The Eye and Treasury of the True Law)*, Vol. III, Tokyo 1975.
- Komine, Michihiko. 四攝事と六波羅蜜の關係 (“Catvāri-saṃgraha-vastu and ṣaṭ-pāramitā”), *Mikkyōgaku Kenkyū (The Journal of Esoteric Buddhist Study)*, No. 7, 1976
- Yaita, Hideomi. 菩薩の寛容—『菩薩地』撰事品の研究—(“A Tolerance of the Bodhisattvas: A Study of the Chapter of Tolerance (saṃgrahavastu) in the Bodhisattvabhūmi”) , *Journal of Naritasan Institute for Buddhist Studies*, No. 35, 2012.

⁽³⁴⁾ This paper is a revised version for publication of my draft prepared for an oral presentation at the International Workshop “The World of Religious Realization” , held by the Center for Humanities, Science and Religion (CHSR) at Ryukoku University on October 24, 2011. The substantial portion of the paper is based on my earlier paper in Japanese “The Four Embracing Practices in Yogācāra School”, *Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Research Association* vol. 72 , 2007. I am grateful to Dr. Dennis Hirota, former professor at Ryukoku University, and Rev. Gyoei Saile of Kofukuji temple who helped me to prepare a draft of English translation of the major portion of the original paper.

——. 菩薩の力量—『菩薩地』力種姓品の研究—(“The Preliminary Strength of the Bodhi sattvas: A Study of the Chapter "balagotra" in the Bodhisattvabhūmi”), *Journal of Naritasan Institute for Buddhist Studies*, No. 38, 2015.

Wakahara, Yusho. “Compassion without Object: The Four Immeasurables (catur-apramāṇa) in Mahāyāna Buddhism”, *ORC Research Series 2*, Ryukoku University Open Research Center for Humanities, Science and Religion (ORC), Kyoto 2006.

——. 唯識派に於ける四攝事—大乘莊嚴經論 XVI 章を中心に—(“The Four Embracing Practices in Yogācāra School”), *Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Research Association*, vol. 72, 2007.